DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 031 437 SP 002 898

By-Gartner, Alan

Do Paraprofessionals Improve Human Services: A First Critical Appraisal of the Data.

New York Univ., N.Y. New Careers Development Center.

Pub Date Jun 69

Note-47p.

Available from-New Careers Development Center, School of Education, New York University, New York, New York 10003 ($1.50; $1.25 in quantity)

EDRS Price MF-$0.25 HC Not Available from EDRS.

Descriptors-*Career Opportunities, *Human Services, *Paraprofessional School Personnel, *Subprofessionals

Identifiers-New Careers Programs

The impact of paraprofessionals in new careers programs on the consumer of human services agencies is critically appraised in this report. Data is presented on the abilities of paraprofessionals in the health fields (in programs such as Outreach and those in which paraprofessionals work as trained dental aides, nutrition counselors, and counselors in community mental health services), law offices, new careers projects in correction institutions, research and senior citizens programs. The effects of new careers programs are also highlighted in the areas of legislation, manpower programs, civil service, credentialling, colleges, career advancement, new service roles, new roles for workers' groups, cost-benefit analysis, and community participation. The need for more extensive and sophisticated methods for data collection and program evaluation is suggested in the report. (Author/SM)

DO PARAPROFESSIONALS IMPROVE HUMAN SERVICES: A FIRST CRITICAL APPRAISAL OF THE DATA

ALAN GARTNER
Associate Director
New Careers Development Center

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

PROCESS WITH MICROFICHE AND PUBLISHER'S PRICES. MICROFICHE REPRODUCTION ONLY.

NEW CAREERS DEVELOPMENT CENTER
School of Education
New York University
New York City, N.Y. 10003

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL BY MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY Alan Gartner, New Careers Dev. C. TO ERIC AND ORGANIZATIONS OPERATING UNDER AGREEMENTS WITH THE U. S. OFFICE OF EDUCATION. FURTHER REPRODUCTION OUTSIDE THE ERIC SYSTEM REQUIRES PERMISSION OF THE COPYRIGHT OWNER."

June, 1969

Copyright © New Careers Development Center, New York University, 1969

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Forward.... 1

Abstract.... 2

Introduction.... 4

Health.... 8

Mental Health.... 12

Education.... 15

Social Services.... 22

Law.... 24

Research.... 28

Senior Citizens.... 30

Conclusion.... 34

New Careers and Legislation.... 35
Manpower Programs.... 36
Civil Service.... 37
Credentialling.... 38
Colleges.... 39
Career Advancement.... 39
New Service Roles.... 41
New Roles for Workers Groups.... 42
Cost-Benefit Analysis.... 43
Community Participation.... 44

Forward

This article is based upon the endeavors of many people. An earlier version was prepared by Patricia Elston, there has been the unstinting participation of Frank Riessman, and we have relied heavily upon studies conducted and reports made by persons around the country. The major contribution, of course, is that of the paraprofessionals throughout the country who have shown the power of their efforts as human service workers.

Abstract

New careers programs were first funded as demonstration efforts under juvenile delinquency prevention and mental health programs in the early 1960's. The Economic Opportunity Act of 1964 with its mandate to hire community people, and the new careers ("Scheuer") amendment to that Act in 1966, gave thrust to the new careers program. In addition, more than thirty laws have established some 100 grant-in-aid programs incorporating or permitting the new careers design. "Scheuer Amendment" programs have involved over 17,000 trainees, while an additional nearly 400,000 persons are employed by community action agencies, schools, health and welfare agencies, law enforcement, recreation and community development agencies.

* * *

The new careers program impinges upon many facets of human service work -- the agency structure, the staffing pattern, the staff members, training and education for human service work, relationships between agency and client and community, impact upon the service's consumers -- the student, patient, client, etc. This paper focuses upon the last of these -- What has been the impact of the use of paraprofessionals upon the consumers of human service agencies?

The data which is presented is suggestive, the multiplicity of examples and the plurality of their approach appears to be persuasive that paraprofessionals can and do make a positive contribution to the work of human service agencies, e.g.

**Paraprofessionals can help children to learn more.
**Paraprofessionals can mean that a health program reaches formerly unreached persons.
**Paraprofessionals can place and hold in jobs more people.
**Paraprofessionals can help a corrections program to cut the recidivism rate.

Data is presented in the fields of health, mental health, education, social services, law, research, and senior citizens programs.

The state of the art of data collection and program evaluation is such that we can only view these findings as suggestive and indicate the need for more extensive and sophisticated analysis, and call for closer attention to the impact upon the service system's consumers in studies of new careers and other human service programs.

In addition to examination of the data concerning the impact of the new careers program upon consumers, we have touched upon the impact of new careers programs in the areas of:

Legislation -- 100 separate grant-in-aid programs authorized under 35 different Acts of Congress administered by eight departments and agencies.

Manpower programs -- the impact upon such private sector programs as JOBS and others.

Civil Service -- the establishment of new titles and new routes to titles in several states.

Credentialling -- the consideration of new certification standards for teachers, as well as the new careers critique of credentialism.

Colleges -- new programs are described and precedents noted.

Career advancement -- a national survey of career advancement in community action agencies is reported upon, and developments in other agencies noted.

New service roles -- both paraprofessionals and professionals undertake new roles as a new career system is established.

New roles for workers' groups -- Unions and other worker groups have come to adopt a new agenda.

Cost-benefit analysis -- the findings of the one survey as yet conducted is noted, along with identification of some of the special problems to be considered in using such a technique in the new careers field.

Community participation -- the special relationship which has been developing between community groups and new careers programs is described and prospects suggested.

Introduction

The new careers program, due to the breadth of its conception and the range of its impact, raises special problems of evaluation. There are at least six broad areas of concern which parallel the areas affected by new careers:

1) The effect upon the new careerist himself. Is he (or she) lifted out of poverty? Is his life changed? Is he a more productive worker? And what of the effects upon his family?

2) The meeting of the agency's manpower needs. Are new staff added? Does the addition of paraprofessionals in fact free professionals's time? What do the professionals do with that time? What is the response of professionals and union organizations?

3) The impact upon the agency's service program. Are present activities extended? New ones added? Are they improved? How are clients affected? For example, do children learn more (or better or faster)?

4) The changes in the agency's organization. Are new personnel schemes established? Is advancement more easily achieved? Are new roles developed? Do all staff benefit?

5) The effect upon training and education for human service workers. Are new opportunities available? Do schools and colleges admit new people, differently prepared? Are new curricula developed? Is credit offered for work, previous learning, life experience?

6) The effect upon the community, upon professionals and professional practice. Is the community stronger, better able to meet its problem? Is professional practice made more relevant? Are there new relationships between community and professionals?

The complexity of human services programs makes such evaluations difficult. As little meaningful evaluation is done of human service programs in general, it is no surprise that the data on new careers programs is sparse, especially as it is less than two years since the funding of the first "Scheuer Amendment" program.[1] Of the areas noted above, there is the most in-

---

[1] Section 123(a)(4), Economic Opportunity Act, as amended. The first significant data is contained in testimony presented before the House Education and Labor Committee, May 21, 1969, by Dr. Jacob Fishman, University Research Corporation, Washington, D.C. It is summarized in the New Careers Newsletter, Special Edition, Spring, 1969, New Careers Development Center, New York University.

formation about the effect upon the trainees and meeting of the agency's manpower needs, in effect standard manpower analyses; and the least about effect upon service system quality, agency reorganization, changes in training and education, and effect upon the community.

The area of service system performance is at one and the same time the most important and the least examined. Most important because ultimately new careers programs must be justified based upon their contribution to how well they help the agency perform its main functions -- e.g. Does the introduction of a new careers program in a school produce greater learning among the children? The difficulty of answering that question is clear in that beyond individual marks, annual reading scores, and the like, schools know little about how to measure children's learning, and what in the school, or elsewhere, affects learning. Nonetheless, it is important and ultimately essential to their success for new careers programs to assess their impact upon the agency's basic goals.

The new careers system involves many components -- entry level employment, career ladders, reorganization of agency work, new training and education programs. And new careers programs seek to relate to many other new developments in the human services -- community control, the helper principle, etc. However, the data which is now available pertains primarily to the use of paraprofessionals in schools, health and welfare programs, corrections and parole, and in research programs. It is here that evidence is mounting that paraprofessionals working alone or in conjunction with professionals can improve an agency's service product -- children's learning, patient's care, etc. Classes with paraprofessionals learn more, health services rendered by paraprofessionals reach more patients, cases handled by paraprofessionals are less likely to result in recidivism.

The evidence concerning human service agency performance is limited. There is no hard evidence for example, as to why paraprofessionals in classroom affect children's learning. There are suggestions and conjectures. Some relate to the general use of paraprofessionals, such as:

1) The "closeness" of the paraprofessional to the service agency recipient in style, color, race, and language when both are from the same community.

2) The role model which the paraprofessional may provide.

3) The system "know how" which the community person brings

to his work.

4) The extra care which the paraprofessional may give when serving the people of his own community.

5) The "bridge" role the paraprofessional can play between agency, client and community.

6) The newness and uniqueness of the program, a "Hawthorne" effect.

7) The power of the "helper therapy" principle in its effect upon the helper and the helped.

Other factors may be peculiar to one field or another. In school work, they may include:

1) Freeing of the teacher to spend more time to teach.

2) Two adults in the classroom gives children a chance to respond to differing styles, personalities, etc.

3) There is more individualized teaching and learning, a decentralizing of the classroom.

4) A second adult gives the child an alternate person to relate to, to work with, with whom to interact.

The remainder of this article will present a compendium of that evidence which is available concerning the effect of paraprofessionals upon an agency's service product. We do so in the desire both to disseminate this information and to encourage all human service programs, those incorporating the new careers system or not, to focus attention upon the effect of their activities upon the consumer.

* * *

Some Methodological Caveats

As Arthur Pearl has said, "There are no new careers programs, only new careers development programs." It is true, of course, that as yet the full scale elaboration of the new careers program has not occured in any single situation; there is no agency which has hired entry level workers, provided training and education for them, moved them up a full career ladder

to professional status, and made the consequent changes in agency staffing and organizational patterns. Thus, for the most part, we are reporting on the results of the use of paraprofessionals -- in some instances as no more than aides, but in many as part of a developing new careers program, although by no means are all these programs funded under the Economic Opportunity Act's new careers (Sec. 123 (a)(4) title. As fuller new careers programs are developed, the effect upon service system performance may be even greater due to the increased training, motivation and change throughout the entire work system. Some of the studies offer suggestions in this regard and we would hope that more data will be forthcoming as programs develop.

New careers programs are at a intermediate stage between a small demonstration project and a mass program. Economic Opportunity Act new careers (Scheuer) programs involve no more than 10,000 trainees, while paraprofessional programs in schools, community action agencies, health and welfare programs involve approximately 400,000 persons. Thus, we have opportunity to see these programs not in the hot house of a pristine demonstration but as a national model, a laboratory in action.

The studies which we report in the following sections have been conducted under a variety of conditions, at varying levels of sophistication, for differing purposes. Their power rests not in any one of them alone but in their cumulative impact, in their suggestive nature, in the pluralism of the approaches.

HEALTH

Paraprofessionals Involved in Outreach:

In the field of health care, data on the high incidence of acute illness among the poor has resulted in legislative appropriations to public health facilities. However, studies, such as that by Brightman, et al[2] reveal that these facilities have been greatly under-utilized by those in greatest need. Paul Cornley and Stanley Bigman[3] have interviewed 400 low-income families in Washington, D.C. in order to determine some of the reasons for under-utilization. Among the reasons given were lack of knowledge about resources available, especially preventive health care --immunizations, prenatal clinics, periodic examinations. In order to inform the poor about available resources, indigenous paraprofessionals workers have been hired to perform outreach functions. The success of these workers has been considerable.

According to James Carl Stewart,[4] where three public health nurses brought in an average of 200 persons a month to an immunization clinic in Oklahoma, 7 indigenous paraprofessional workers serving the same areas during the next year brought in 2,000 persons a month. Thus with only 2½ times as many workers, 10 times the number of people responded.

Steven Polgar[5] reports similar results with neighborhood

---

[2]Brightman, I., H. Notkin, W. Brumfield, S. Dorsey, and H. Solomon, "Knowledge and Utilization of Health Resources by Public Assistance Recipients," American Journal of Public Health and the Nations Health, 1958, 48.

[3]Cornley, Paul B., and Stanley K. Bigman, "Some Considerations in Changing Health Attitudes," Children, 1963, 10.

[4]Stewart, James Carl, "Employment of Indigenous Personnel as a Strategy for Increasing Immunization Rates in 'Hard Core' Areas," Doctoral Dissertation, University of Oklahoma, 1967.

[5]Polgar, Steven, "United States: The PPFA Mobile Service Project in New York City," Studies in Family Planning, 1966, 15.

workers in door-to-door canvassing for a Planned Parenthood mobile service unit in New York City. James Kent and Harvey Smith[6] have found that neighborhood representatives can raise the level of participation in maternal and infant care clinics by a factor of 42 per cent. Furthermore, these workers have been able to encourage expectant mothers to come for care earlier in their pregnancy than has been their practice heretofore.

In Contra Costa, California, paraprofessionals working for the country Health Department were assigned 30 families whose cases were considered "closed" because the Department with its public health nurses and other professional staff could make no further contact. The paraprofessional health aides were able to "reopen" 26 of these cases and provide at least some positive help.[7]

Selection, Training, Supervision, Role Definition Guidelines Needed:

While the data collected by Kent and Smith clearly demonstrates the valuable contribution of the indigenous paraprofessional worker, the authors do not support the contention that any indigenous person can perform at the level required. Instead they point to the need for further research: "Critical to the ultimate success of the neighborhood representative are: the criteria used in their selection and recruitment; the nature of their training; the style of their supervision and their specific role function." Similar findings are reported in an extensive study of new careers in public schools.[8]

---

[6]Kent, James, A., and Harvey C. Smith, "Involving the Urban Poor in Health Services through Accomodation - the Employment of Neighborhood Representatives," American Journal of Public Health, 1967, 57.

[7]As reported in the New Careers Newsletter, New Careers Development Center, New York University, New York City, N.Y., Vol. II, No. 6.

[8]Garda Bowman and Gordon Klopf, New Careers and Roles in the American School, Bank Street College, New York City, N.Y., Vol. II, No. 6.

Frank Moore's doctoral dissertation[9] on selection of new careerists for the New Orleans Family Planning Program is an important step in this direction. He notes that the two most commonly used selection devices--the objective test focused on manual and verbal skills and the personal interview -- are both inappropriate and invalid for selection of paraprofessional workers. To devise an appropriate screening method, he set up a panel of "judges" composed of professionals and paraprofessionals. He found that the professional "judges" predicted more accurately the success of applicants in follow-up visiting, while paraprofessional "judges" predicted more accurately the success of applicants in outreach work.

A broader implication of Moore's work is that paraprofessional workers might be involved in more aspects of health care than outreach functions--for example, in personnel and administration, in training, and in direct services. This is particularly important as the outreach function is one in which workers work their way out of a job ultimately, as soon as they have effectively informed the community and recruited those clients who are in need of services.

Paraprofessionals Give Dental Service

Recent projects illustrate the trend toward involvement of paraprofessional workers in more significant aspects of health care. Paraprofessionals have provided direct services in dental care, working in teams with professionals at the U.S. Navy Training Center in Great Lakes, Illinois.[10] In 7 weeks, 12 dental technicians were trained to insert restorations in cavities prepared by dental officers. After 20 weeks on the job, tests showed that:

1. A dental officer operating at 3 chairs and delegating certain operative procedures to trained technicians can treat twice the number of patients and can significantly increase the number of restorations placed when compared to the traditional one-chair pattern. Two dental officers tested increased their productivity by more than 100%; a third by 80%.

---

[9]Frank I. Moore, "A Model for the Selection of Indigenious Personnel for Family Planning Clinics in Low-Income Neighborhoods", Doctoral Dissertation, University of Oklahoma, 1968.

[10]As reported in the New Careers Newsletter, New Careers Development Center, New York University, Vol. II, no. 1.

2. Short-term evaluations of random samples of the restorations placed by the dental teams were found to be comparable to restorations placed by professionals alone.

Nutrition Counselors

Nutritional deficiencies, especially anemia, are frequent occurences among poor children; studies done in Boston, New York, Chicago, Washington, D.C., and Los Angeles report the incidence of iron deficiency anemia ranging from 21% to 76% among groups of children in these cities. A Los Angeles program, funded by the Children's Bureau, sought to test whether indigenous health aides could successfully counsel parents about this condition -- iron deficiency anemia, and to compare their effectiveness with that of middle-class professionals. Based upon evaluation of the extent and degree of compliance with counseling instructions and their recall of nutrition information, those parents counseled by the indigenous workers performed as well or better than did those counseled by second-year medical students. The aides received 16 hours of training over a period of a week, and then spent 40 hours observing a professional dietician counsel the parents. The aides were recruited from the local Youth Opportunities Unit, and were either Negro or Mexican-American, between 18 and 22 years of age. The authors of the study conclude, "Indeed, the indigenous nonprofessional may be even more effective than the professional in transmitting technical advice in a less formal manner."[10a]

[10a] Willis A. Wingert, William Larson, and David B. Friedman, "Indigenous Health Aides as Counselors to Parents About Nutrition," Public Health Reports, Vol. 84, No. 4 (April, 1969), pp. 331.

MENTAL HEALTH[11]

Counseling

With a training pattern involving some 100 hours of training over a three month period, and a short follow-up period, the Arkansas Rehabilitation and Training Center was able to train persons without college education to be effective in producing significant and positive changes in mildly and severely disturbed clients. The nonprofessionals were able to do this at a level of effectiveness significantly above that of post-practicum and post-internship trainees in counseling and psychotherapy involved in doctoral training and nearly commensurate with that of highly experienced and effective counselors. In fact, in a controlled study at a residential vocational rehabilitation facility, patients were randomly assigned to 1) counselor aides working in a team with a professional, 2) professionals working alone, and 3) to counselor aides working under a professional, but with independent contact with the caseload. With progress measured by client's work production, his work attitude, and his dependability, the best results were obtained by the aides working under the supervision of professional counselors.[12]

The broad field of counseling has been one where paraprofessionals have made considerable impact. In private sector manpower programs, for example, the Labor Department reports that "follow-up" activities with clients should use indigenious workers since experience shows that their performance in follow-

---

[11]For a consideration of the issues involved in evaluating training programs for new personnel see "The Evaluation of Mental Health Training Programs," a seminar sponsored by the Illinois Department of Mental Health and National Institute of Mental Health, Chicago, Illinois (June, 1967).

[12]Charles B. Truax, "The Use of Supportive Personnel in Rehabilitation Counseling: Process and Outcome," Arkansas Rehabilitation and Training Center, University of Arkansas. Truax, and associates, have more than a score of additional papers on this and related topics.

up work surpasses that of professional workers."[13] Also, the Job Corps, and other residential programs, have extensively used paraprofessionals as counselors and trainers.

Community Mental Health

The new community mental health programs have developed a variety of activities of an innovative nature; indeed, the very concept of a community mental health program is a new idea. The use of paraprofessionals has been a key factor in many of these programs. One of the areas in which these new workers have played a key part has been in reaching the people of the community. For example, two Neighborhood Service Centers, part of the Lincoln Hospital Mental Health Services in the south Bronx, New York, staffed by a professional and five to ten community mental health aides, reached some 6,620 new cases in their first six months of full operation.[14]

More people were served and new patterns of service developed. Hallowitz describes expediting services, a friend-in-need, sociotherapy, supervised work and volunteer activities as well as new services such as services to psychotics and to disturbed children.[15]

Not only can community mental health workers extend and expand the services, they can make a concrete contribution to the quality and effectiveness of the service.

---

[13]"Job Development of the Hard-to-Employ," Manpower Administration, U.S. Department of Labor, 1968. Much of the work using paraprofessionals in follow-up, as coaches and buddies, is based on programs developed at the "Jobs Now" project of the Chicago Y.M.C.A.

[14]Frank Riessman and Emanuel Hallowitz, "The Neighborhood Service Center: An Innovation in Prevention Psychiatry," American Journal of Psychiatry, 123:11, (May, 1967).

[15]Emanual Hallowitz, "The Expanding Role of the Neighborhood Service Center," in Frank Riessman and Hermine Popper, Up From Poverty: New Career Ladders for Nonprofessionals, New York, Harper & Row, 1968.

> "...it is evident that nonprofessionals can intervene in critical situations, engage comparatively pathological people in meaningful relationships, stimulate them to take action in their own behalf, mobilize community resources, and serve as bridge between the client-in-need and the professional staff. We are able to see that the nonprofessional is able to do quite a number of tasks that usually are carried out by the professional... The aides also have influenced the delivery of professional service, both within our organization and others.[16]

While many other factors are involved in such self-help programs as Alocholics Anonymous and Synanon, the use of those in need of help--the helper therapy principle -- and those who have "graduated" from the program, both "nonprofessionals," has apparently been an important factor in the success of these and other similar programs.[17]

---

[16]Emanuel Hallowitz, and Frank Riessman, "The Role of the Indigenious Nonprofessional in a Community Mental Health Neighborhood Service Center Program," American Journal of Ortho-Psychiatry, XXVII, No. 4, (July, 1967).

[17]See for example, Rita Volkman and Donald R. Cressey, "Differential Association and Rehabilitation of Drug Addicts," in Riessman, Cohen and Pearl (eds.), Mental Health of the Poor, N.Y., Free Press, 1964.

EDUCATION

National Study Findings

A study conducted for the U.S. Office of Education of all compensatory programs for the disadvantaged reported on between 1963 and 1968 found that of the 1,000 programs examined, only 23 were found to have yielded "measured educational benefits of cognitive achievement." Of these 23, 10 involved the use of paraprofessionals. As the time lag in reporting programs means that most of the reports were for programs operating prior to 1967, a time when the use of paraprofessionals was only beginning to play a major role in the schools, the power of their use is likely to have been under-estimated.[18]

Instructional Roles

Recent studies in Indiana, Minnesota, Michigan, Colorado, Oregon, California, and New York indicate the effect upon pupil learning of the use of paraprofessionals in the classroom. In Minneapolis, pupil learning, as measured by pre-test pairs using the Metropolitan Reading Readiness Test given at five month intervals to 234 children, was 50% greater in kindergarten classes with an aide then where there was no aide. The classes with an aide had an average total readiness gain of 15 points, from a pre-test score of 49 to a post-test of 64, compared with an average total readiness gain of 10 points for those classes with no aides.[19] Similar gains were shown in reading readiness and number readiness. In Greenburgh, N.Y., performance of second grade classes with an aide were compared with similar classes the previous school year which had no aides. The measuring instrument was the Metropolitan Achievement Test. The number of classes scoring above grade level increased from 2 to 5 and those scoring below grade level decreased from 5 to 4. The project's director states that it was the introduction of the teacher aides which is responsible for this achievement test out-

---

[18] "A Study of Selected Programs for the Education of Disadvantaged Children," American Institute for Research, Palo Alto, California, 1968. It is highly unlikely that among the entire 1,000 projects paraprofessionals were involved in 43% of them.

[19] "Teacher Aide Project," Minneapolis Public Schools, Minneapolis, Minnesota, 1968.

come.[20] And in Greeley, Colorado, in a Title III, ESEA program where demonstrable pupil performance gains were achieved, the teachers attribute these gains primarily to the introduction of paraprofessionals.[21]

A study conducted by Greenleigh Associates for OEO to ascertain the most effective adult basic education program found that in each of the systems tested the most effective teacher was a paraprofessional, as compared with a regular teacher or a certified remedial reading teacher.

Tutoring programs using paraprofessionals have been established in some 50 different communities in 12 states. The paraprofessionals are given 21 hours of programmed instruction in tutoring, and then tutor youngsters fifteen minutes a day, five days a week. Among the findings of the program are that:

--a significantly greater proportion of tutored children progressed normally -- that is advanced from second to third grade, 59%, than did those in the control group, 41%.
--those receiving tutoring were 59% less likely to be assigned to a special education class than were those in the control group.[22]

Reading scores are a limited measure of pupil performance, nor have the gains been of the magnitude we seek. We would want to see careful study of the impact of paraprofessionals upon a broader spectrum of pupil activities, including the critical component of youngsters learning how to learn. Here the utilization of children in teaching roles, as well as learners, can have marked effect.

Students as Teachers

The New York Board of Education, in reporting on a program conducted by Mobilization for Youth, states that over a five

---

[20] Project description in material distributed at the "National Conference on Paraprofessionals, Career Advancement, and Pupil Learning," co-sponsored by TEPS-NEA and the New Careers Development Center, New York University.

[21] "Exemplary Education for Early Childhood" PACE, Weld County School District, Greeley, Colorado (July, 1968).

[22] "Programmed Tutoring Follow-Up," The Reading Center, School of Education, Indiana University, May, 1969; see also, description of project in material distributed at the "National Conference on Paraprofessionals, Career Advancement, and Pupil Learning." op cit.

month period where older children (themselves poor students) tutored younger children with reading difficulties, those tutored gained 6.0 months compared to a control group's gain of 3.5 months, while the tutors gained an extraordinary 2.4 years compared to a control group gain of 7.0 months. A leap of this magnitude is the order of achievement that we must strive for in the introduction and use of paraprofessionals.

On a broader basis, the National Commission on Resources for Youth organized "Youth Tutors Youth Centers" in Newark, Philadelphia, and Washington, D.C., with results similar to those obtained at Mobilization for Youth. This design has spread to some fifteen additional cities. Additionally impressive in the National Commission's design is the introduction of this model into the Neighborhood Youth Corps with older members operating the centers, younger ones tutoring, and with a plan for Washington, D.C. to have the graduates become tutor trainers.

Here we can identify one of the powerful instruments for sharp educational gains: allowing students to become teachers as quickly as possible. The cross-aged learning designs of Ronald Lipitt provide some of the most soundly conceived and most thoroughly tested concepts of current study. The opportunities are myriad: cross-aged teaching, student teacher-learner teams, dividing of classes or sections so that each one is presented different material by a professional teacher and then the students are paired allowing one to teach the other. A program planned at the new state university college at Old Westbury, New York, plans to use the model of students as teachers as its central focus. The new Education Professions Development Act encourages such efforts, as do the guidelines written by state departments of education in several states.

Parent Educators

A Florida program, which trained 15 women to work with preschool children, has produced marked effect upon the children's development of a variety of skills. The project, "Early Child Stimulation Through Parent Education," conducted at the College of Education, University of Florida, under a HEW Children's Bureau research grant, found "that this type of program does have a clear payoff in enchanced development of the infants whose mothers are reached in their homes." The "parent educa-

tors," themselves "disadvantaged," worked with nearly 300 mothers and their children. The major work of the "parent educators" was instructing the mothers in a series of stimulation exercises designed to provide physical, intellectual and social stimulation for the children, ages three months old through 2 years of age. On a standard measure of assessment (the Griffiths Mental Development Scale), the children whose mothers were so trained performed better on all scales -- locomotor, personal-social, hearing and speech, eye and hand, and General Performance, than did those in a matched control group whose parents did not receive this training.[23]

A New York City program, STAR (Supplementary Teaching Assistance in Reading), uses paraprofessionals to train parents to read to their children. Studies done on the youngsters, first grade pupils from predominantly Puerto Rican families whose teachers identified them as likely reading failures, found that the children whose parents were trained one hour per week to read to them scored higher in nine different reading tests than did matched children who received two hours of remediation per week from professionals, or a control group.

The "Street Academies" and Harlem Prep, sponsored by the Urban League and supported initially by the Ford Foundation, are yet another instance of using paraprofessionals as part of a new and more intensive involvement in the life of the community and the student. Street workers, themselves of the community, act, in the words of an Urban League official, as the "motivator, counselor, friend, father. disciplinarian, and

---

[23]To test the hypothesis that the mere social reinforcement of the presence of a visitor in the home might have some effect on the motivational pattern of the mother and thus on the behavior and development of the child, the researchers compared those who were visited monthly by a Visiting Nurse and those who did not receive such visits; these included equal numbers of persons from the group who received the stimulation training and the control group. The study found that there was no significant difference between those who received the nurses' visits and those who did not. New Careers Newsletter, Vol. III, No. 2

companion. He becomes the great encourager."[24]

Paraprofessionals Perform Successfully in Non-Instructional Roles

A study of 4,904 paraprofessionals teacher aides working in Wayne County, Michigan, under Title III ESEA funds shows that the paraprofessional is viewed by school administrators and teachers as effective in improving students education, this despite the fact that of the 250 tasks performed by aides, most are monitorial and clerical in nature rather than instructional.[25]

Cost-Benefits Shown:

A return of $1.59 for every $1.00 spent in the new careers program is estimated in a recent study at the University of Minnesota.[26] The author examines direct project costs, estimated at approximately $5,400 per trainee, and compares them with anticipated direct public benefits of savings in welfare and unemployment compensation costs, costs of administering welfare programs, and the income to the government of the additional earning made possible by education. Because of the complexity of the issue and the inadequacy of present measuring devices, the author notes that the accounting does not measure benefits to the individuals nor such public benefits as the effect upon the children of the new careerists; upon their friends, neighbors and community; their greater participation in civic affairs and in the political processes, etc.

In his conclusion, the author, having indicated that "an attempt was made to keep estimates of success rates and expected income at a conservative level," finds that "a strong case can be made for considerating the New Careers project in Minneapolis a sound economic investment."

---

[24]Cited in "Where 'Failures' Make the Grade: Two Schools for Dropouts", Carnegie Quarterly, XVI, N6. 4., (Fall, 1968).

[25]New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 1.

[26]New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 5

There is a growing body of data which indicate that paraprofessionals allow teachers time to give more individualized attention to children, to spend more time in preparation both in school and at home (apparently the audience, which now includes another adult, encourages greater preparatory efforts upon teachers' part), and improves the climate for learning.[27] Much more needs to be done in the way of research and evaluation; an Oregon project funded by the Office of Education's Division of Vocational Education, Bureau of Research, examining both the costs and benefits of the use of paraprofessionals, and the relationship between the two, points the way to a necessary area of study. The illustrations presented here, representative of many others,[28] do indicate, however, that aides can make a significant impact upon pupil learning and that their continued use and further training can have an even more powerful effect.

Spin-Off Effects of New Careers Programs:

An improvement in the professional teacher's performance and increased community support are two important spin-off effects noted in an aide program in Hartsdale, N.Y. According to the report, "It is interesting to note that where experienced (or second year) teacher-aides are working, the role of the teacher with whom the aide works is changed. The teacher has become a more proficient diagnostician. The requirement of assigning a child to an aide for reinforcement has demanded a more definitive approach to specifically what the child should be learning...Significantly, parents have become the greatest supports for the aide program, and an organized group of parents now plans to bring pressure to bear on the Board of Education to have the aides program expanded through local support. The aide project has become accepted enough to be on the list of our local teachers' union organization as to groups who should be organized for the next school year.[29]

---

[27] See "National Conference on Paraprofessionals..., "op. cit., passim.

[28] Ibid.

[29] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. I, No. 3.
Similar findings as to the new role for teachers are reported in Garda Bowman and Gordon J. Klopf, New Careers and Roles in the American School, New York, Bank Street College of Education, 1968, as well as in other studies conducted by this Bank Street team under a contract with Office of Economic Opportunity.

The effect of the program upon the trainees is shown in a Cleveland, Ohio, report that 80 ADC mothers' reading skills rose 1.6 grade levels and math skills increased 2.2 years during a 5 month Teacher Assistant training program where they worked 17 hours in the public schools and trained 10-12 hours at Case Western Reserve University.[30]

---

[30] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 2.

SOCIAL SERVICES

Paraprofessionals Speed Delivery of Services:

The Alameda County Welfare Aide Project demonstrated that former recipients employed as case aides in public welfare can provide valuable social services to clients. On a list of 15 distinct types of services, Alameda County Welfare aides checked those services they gave each client. While the most common was transportation, a high proportion of service fell within the area of giving information and counseling.[31] And with an aide helping applicants to fill out forms, social workers in Intake reported a 30-40 minute savings in time per applicant interview.

Professional-Paraprofessional Teamwork

A professional-paraprofessional team may be the most effective means of providing certain services. According to a report of the Unified Social Services Project, Community Progress, Inc.[32] New Haven:

> "the combination of professional and paraprofessional in a social service team would provide the most effective kind of service...This would maximize success at reduced costs..." (Our emphasis.)

---

[31] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 6.

[32] The New Haven anti-poverty programs has been an early and consistant user of paraprofessionals, as well as an implementer of career advancement for them. For example, a recent study of the New Careers Training Laboratory, New York University, reports that of the 179 professional positions in New Haven's Community Progress, Inc. (CPI) program, 39% are now filled by persons who had come to the agency as nonprofessionals. Similarly, the Community Action Institute, a training agency "spin-off" of CPI, reports that 41% of its professional positions are now filled by former nonprofessionals. For the complete national survey, some 18% of professional positions in community action agencies are filled by former nonprofessionals.

This conclusion is supported by two major findings: (1) Given the same number of contacts with clients, teams consisting of a professional Social Worker and either a paraprofessional Homemaker Advisor or Neighborhood Worker were more successful in solving clients' problems than a team of professionals or paraprofessionals alone. (2) Such teams achieved positive results with fewer contacts than Social Workers operating independently.

The author, Bernard Neugeboren, now a professor at Rutgers University, indicates that differential use of personal is an important means of realizing improved services.

> "There are differences in effectiveness between the various staff in terms of the kinds of problems dealt with in cases... For housing and financial problems, the paraprofessionals by themselves appear to achieve high success rates."

Not only does the report suggest staffing changes--introduction of paraprofessionals and use of teams--but also changes in the service ideology of agencies.

> "Direct services may have to be more concerned with trying to change situations rather than primarily on trying to change persons to adapt to inadequate situations."

Project Enable, jointly sponsored by the National Urban League and the Family Service Association of America under an OEO grant, involved paraprofessionals serving some 30,000 poor families in 600 communities. A follow-up study of local project directors reports that they considered the employment of paraprofessionals as the most effective way to provide social services to poor families. The Final Project reports stated, "Project Enable demonstrated that low income people, without prior training or experience, could simultaneously serve the community and receive on-the-job training. The social welfare client became the helper." (Our emphasis)

LAW

Police

The problems of evaluation in other human services areas are magnified several fold in police work. A Richmond, California police-community aide program suggests both the range of evaluative data and its limitations. A citizen's advisory committee has praised the program, the police department staff use it, families not previously reached by programs such as the Juvenile Aid Bureau have been reached, and persons served by the program give it strong affirmative support.[33]

Law offices

From a quite different perspective, non-professionals working in a private law firm have contributed to the firms productivity and profit. For example a Great Bend, Kansas firm employs 23 nonprofessionals to work with 3 lawyers, while a Boston firm has 65 lawyers assisted by several score nonprofessionals. In each of these firms, the non-professionals do work which in other firms would be done by professional lawyers.[34]

The Dixwell Legal Services program, part of the New Haven anti-poverty program, has used paraprofessionals extensively, as well as trained others for work in legal services programs throughout the country. A recent OEO-sponsored study called for the use of paraprofessionals as neighborhood workers, case workers, claims adjusters, investigators and divorce specialists.[35] And the convention of the American Bar Association resolved, "That the legal profession recognize that there are many tasks in serving a client's needs which can be performed

---

[33] Lisa Liebert, "Police-Community Relations and the Role of the Nonprofessional", New Careers Development Center, January, 1968. See also, "New Police Careers," in Frank Riessman and Hermine Popper, Up From Poverty: New Career Ladders for Nonprofessionals, N.Y., Harper and Row, 1968.

[34] Richardson White, Jr., and John H. Stein, "Paraprofessionals in Legal Services Programs: A Feasibility Study," National Institute for Justice and Law Enforcement, Washington, DC, 1968.

[35] Ibid.

by a trained, non-lawyer assistant working under the direction and supervision of a lawyer.[36]

Corrections

One of the most successful new careers programs was that conducted by J. Douglas Grant in the California Men's Prison.[37] The program was unique in that it was conducted in a prison, and that the participants (the prisoners) were trained not to work in a particular service area but as general new careers program developers and trainers. The eighteen participants, half of whom had been convicted of armed robbery, have gone on to play key leadership roles in new careers programs throughout the country, while four years later only one had been reconfined.[38] One of the participants was the organizer of the National Association of New Careerists, another is its president,[39] a third is the director of a California new careers program, a fourth has been a senior trainer in several anti-poverty programs and is the organizer of the city-wide Los Angelos New Careers Organization (LANCO), and a fifth holds the number two position in the Youth Services Office of the Department of Health, Education and Welfare.[40]

---

[36] Proceedings of the August, 1968 meeting of the House of Delegates of the American Bar Association, 54 A.B.A.J., 1021 (1968).

[37] J. Douglas Grant, "The Offender as a Correctional Manpower Resource," Up From Poverty, op. cit.

[38] Offenders as a Correctional Manpower Resource," Joint Commission on Correctional Manpower and Training, Washington, DC, 1968, p. 3. See also the extensive listing of offenders used in correctional institutions and the bibliography.

[39] In fact, the entire staff of that new careers program, Oakland, California, consists of new careerists.

[40] A similar program to train new careers program developers was developed for New York City's Human Resources Agency by one of the graduates of the California Mens Prison program.

A program somewhat similar to that in the California Prison is that of involving "graduates" of a group rehabilitation center, Essexfields,[41] as "human resource consultants" by Scientific Resources, Inc., a New Jersey training and technical assistance corporation.[42] The young men have been successfully trained as program consultants, trainers, tutors, counselors, researchers and community organizers. Training programs for judges, parole agents, and probation officers have used former offenders.[43]

Several training institutions have used paraprofessionals, not necessarily those who have had contact with the law, as trainers. Notable are the efforts of the Community Action Institute of New Haven, the Community Action Training Institute, New Jersey, and the New Careers Training Laboratory. In each of these programs, career ladders have been developed for advancement.

In Milwaukee, former offenders work with parolees and probationers. The project is operated by the Commandos, former members of the militant Milwaukee NAACP, and is funded by the state. Initial project reports indicate that the parole revocation rate for those youth served by the project was only 25% as compared with a statewide average of 50%.[44] A similar project conducted by the Career Development Department of Harlem's Haryou-Act reports, 75% of former inmates released through the intercession of the program have not been subsequently arrested, three times the general rate.[45] And a program using ex-offenders has just begun in Los Angeles.

---

[41] Pilnick et al, "The Essexfields Concept." A New Approach to the Social Treatment of Juvenile Delinquents, The Journal of Applied Behaviorial Research, II, 1 (1966).

[42] Saul Pilnick, "Adolescent Integrity: From Highfields to Essexfields, Collegefields and Scientific Resources, Incorporated," Presented at a Conference on Training the Nonprofessional, Washington, D.C., 1967.

[43] J. Douglas Grant, "Vital Components of a model program Using the Offender in the Administration of Justice, 'Offenders as a Correctional Manpower Resource, Joint Commission on Correctional Manpower and Training, Washington, D.C., 1968.

[44] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 6.

[45] Amsterdam News, April 20, 1969.

Former offenders have been used as advocates for arrestees in New York[46] and California.[47] Selected arrestees, at the point of arraignment, are assigned to the project with the understanding that if they cooperate with the program their trial will be postponed and if after three months they have made a satisfactory adjustment, charges will be dismissed. Former offenders are used as job developers and to provide supportive services.

---

[46]T.S. Chittendere, Manhattan Court Employment Project. (New York, Vera Institute of Justice, 1968); see also New Careers Newsletter, Vol. III, No. 1.

[47]Cited in Grant, "Vital Components," op. cit.

RESEARCH

Paraprofessionals have contributed not only to the direct delivery of services but also to research concerning human service work. The military, which often trains nonprofessionals to do what in civilian life is professional work, conducts much of its research and studies using nonprofessionals. A large-scale study of the military non-conformists, as well as one involving delinquency prediction, showed that:

> "1) Many necessary research tasks can be performed with a minimum of training. These are not limited to computational routines.
>
> 2) An apprenticeship can be served on the job as well as in graduate school."[48]

As with the military, penal institutions often use their own population to do what would be professional tasks on the outside. The Indiana system uses prisoners to do data-processing operations as does South Carolina and Washington, while Michigan and California use the men to do programming as well. And in California, prisoner initiated research has led to internal prison reforms.[49]

The New York State Division for Youth program employed unemployed adolescents as interviewers to ascertain whether they would develop differential and additional material from fellow adolescents than had professional employees. The success of this project,[50] led to a more elaborate research training project at the Center for Youth and Community Studies, Howard University. Here, a year before the "new careers" amendment to the Economic Opportunity Act was passed, a group of ten school dropouts were trained for new careers -- four in day care, four

---

[48] Joan Grant, "The Industry of Discovery: New Roles for the Nonprofessional," in Arthur Pearl and Frank Riessman, New Careers for the Poor, N.Y., The Free Press, 1965.

[49] Ibid. A shortcoming of this report is the lack of precise data.

[50] Ibid.

in recreation, and the two trained in research by studying the other eight and the Washington, D.C., community.[51] Arthur Pearl, one of the designers of the Howard project, reported that within six weeks the youth learned to conduct and tape-record interviews, to code and prepare these interviews for key punch, to run a counter-sorter, to wire an IBM 407, to prepare instructions for a programmer in 1620 computer, to operate desk calculators to compute percentages, means, medians, standard deviations, chi square, rank order correlations, product moment correlations, and other statistical manipulations.[52]

The ability of paraprofessionals as researchers to develop unique information noted in the small New York State Division for Youth project was more amply demonstrated in the work of "Project Enable" involving 30,000 poor families in 600 communities. Commenting upon the data collected by the Social Work Aides, Dr. Orville Brim of the Russell Sage Foundation, said, "The richest material now available on working with lower class parents comes from Project Enable."

Similarly offenders -- both those incarcerated[53] and those released[54] -- have been used to obtain information hitherto unobtainable. As Grant notes, the new methodological approach involving the active participation by the subjects of the research efforts is particularly suitable to the use of offenders,[55] as well as members of other indigenous groups.

---

[51] New Careers for the Poor, op cit., pp. 118, f.

[52] Up From Poverty, op cit., pp. 39, f.

[53] Hans Toch, "The Study of Man: The Convict as Researcher," Trans-Action, IV (1967), pp. 72-75.

[54] D. Grant, "Vital Components....," op cit.

[55] Ibid.

SENIOR CITIZENS

A special set of programs are those involving senior citizens in a variety of human services work activities. Building upon the success of such programs as OEO's "Medicare Alert" and "Foster Grandparents,"[56] these programs have demonstrated that the older person can both deliver a needed service to others and gain benefit himself.[57] Among a growing list of programs, the following indicate the range and scope of present projects, although as yet only the first two have developed data concerning the effectiveness of the work.

--A Rochester, N.Y., program uses retired persons, 65 to 80 years old, with children, grades 1-3, who were having school difficulties, to the children's profit according

---

[56]Rosalyn Saltz, "Foster-Grandparents and Institutionalized Young Children: Two Years of a Foster-Grandparent Program," Report of the Foster-Grandparent Research Project, Merrill-Palmer Institute, Detroit, September, 1968.

[57]Footnote omitted.

to teacher evaluations.[58]

--A Boulder, Colorado, program has senior citizens employed to assist elderly retarded patients at a state hospital, and combines an employment program for the elderly, the combatting of mental retardation, as well as serving older people.[59]

--In a Winnetka, Illinois, program older adults work on a one-to-one basis with underachieving youth.[60]

--In a Louisville, Kentucky, program they work with junior high school youngsters in individualized instruction, small group work, and remedial work.[61]

--In a Fort Lauderdale, Florida, program they assist teachers in some forty schools in working with disruptive children.[62]

--In a Charleston, South Carolina, program they work with children who have been rejected by Headstart because of emotional reasons.[63]

--In Clearwater, Florida, they serve in recreation, legal services, information and referral programs.[64]

---

[58]Cowan, et al, "Utilization of Retired People as Mental Health Aides with Children," Journal of Orthopsychiatry, XXXVIII, 3 (October, 1968).

[59]In order to assist the reader who might wish additional material on these projects, we shall note the funding sources and, where possible, the local contact for further information of each project noted. Title III, OAO, Stephen Chiovaro, Superintendent, Boulder River School and Hospital, Boulder, Colorado.

[60]Direct AoA grant, administered by Mrs. Janice Freund, 1155 Oak St., Winnetka, Illinois.

[61]Direct Aoa grant to TEAM, Inc., 207 W. Market St., Louisville, Kentucky.

[62]Title III, OAO grant through state agency, to Economic Opportunity Coordinating Group of Boward County, Ft. Lauderdale, Florida.

[63]OEO funded Foster Grandparents program.

[64]Title III, OAO grant to Senior Citizens Services, Inc., Clearwater, Florida.

--In Orleans County, Vermont, senior citizens keep open some twelve rural libraries.[65]

--Throughout the state of Maine senior citizens work in a variety of food services programs.[66]

--In Burlington, Vermont, they work in five different consumer education programs.[67]

--In Paintsville, Kentucky, they are engaged in a six county home improvement program.[68]

--In a citywide program in Portland, Oregon, senior citizens are employed in a wide range of agencies including the state employment service and university medical school, the county welfare department and council on the aging, and several private social welfare agency including the Urban League, Family Counseling Service and Volunteers of America.[69]

There is now a growing literature which points to the benefits to the older person of being engaged in a work project, especially those in which the elder person is helping others. For example, an Illinois project where older people worked in a nursery

---

[65]Direct Aoa grant administered by Donald Donnelly, 10 Main St., Newport, Vermont.

[66]Part of the National Council on the Aging's (NCOA) Senior Community Service Program, administered by Maine Division of Economic Opportunity, State House, Augusta, Maine.

[67]Another NCOA project administered by the Champlain Valley Office of Economic Opportunity, 80 St. Paul Street, Burlington, Vermont.

[68]Another NCOA project administered by the Big Sandy Area Community Action Program, Inc., Johnson County Courthouse. Paintsville, Kentucky.

[69]Another NCOA project administered by the City-County Council on Aging, 516 S.W. Fourth Avenue, Portland, Oregon.

found that while only 48% of the people reported that they felt happy before the project, 90% reported that they did while involved in the project. Those who felt themselves to be useful increased from 85% to 97%, while those who felt hopeful about the future grew from 68% to 84%, and finally those who felt independent grew from 64% to 87%.[70]

---

[70] W.S. Rybak, J.M. Sandavitch, and B.J. Mason, "Psycho-Social Changes in Personality During Foster Grandparents Program," Journal of the American Geritrics Society, XVI, 8 (August, 1968). See Also, Rosalyn Saltz, "Foster-Grandparents and Institutionalized Young Children: Two Years of a Foster-Grandparent Program," Report of the Foster-Grandparent Research Project, Merrill-Palmer Institute, Detroit, September, 1968. And a recent report contrasts those who worked as volunteers and those who worked for pay and reported that while the latter had a more favorable view of themselves, enjoyed a better relationship with others, and tended to be more satisfied with their lives than did those who did no work, the volunteers were closer in these characteristics to the non-worker than to those who worked for pay. Francis Carp, "Differences Among Older Workers, Volunteers, and Persons Who Are Neither," Journal of Gerontology, XXIII, 4 (October, 1968).

CONCLUSION

The multiple goals of new careers programs -- anti-poverty, rational use of manpower, service extension and improvement, community involvement, new training and education designs -- demand sophisticated evaluation criteria. It is important to study changes in agency effectiveness as well as in trainee performance; changes in the quality and quantity of services rendered as well as in trainee attitudes and advancement.

This article indicates some of the effects upon the quality of the service as it effects individuals. We also need information as to the effect upon families and whole communities, the changes -- if any -- in the style and tone of the service.

While considerable information is being developed on attitudes of trainees and their supervisors gleaned from the "Scheuer" and other new careers programs, less information is available on the broader aspects of the improvement and operation of human service systems. Information contained in this article is neither complete nor definite. What is required is thorough, in-depth study of the ramifications of new careers progrmas.

The problems of evaluation of comprehensive human service programs are gaining increased recognition. Students are increasingly recognizing the limitations of cost-benefit analysis and experimental models,[71] which each works best,[72] are not frequently to be found in most

---

[71] Robert S. Weiss, and Martin Rein, "Evaluation of Broad-Aim Social Programs," Presented at a Conference on Evaluation of Social Action Programs, American Academy of Arts and Sciences, Brookline, Massachusetts, May, 1969.

[72] Rein suggests that cost-benefit analysis works best when the class of options is exhaustive, the problems of interpersonal comparison of utility are not significantly different, and the problems of comparability are maximal. On the other hand, experimental models work best when there is maximum control over randomization, the imput is authentic, real and of sufficient magnitude, and the outputs are explicit. The problem is that reality does not allow the meeting of the ideal standards for either model. Thus, researchers are led to make compromises in using either model. The question then becomes whether their findings are in fact a function of the evidence or of those compromises.

settings. Therefore, while efforts should continue to adapt and adopt these methods, continued use must be made of learning from experience -- from field experience, social bookkeeping, political and historical analysis.

What the data presented do indicate is that paraprofessionals can make significant contributions to the extension and improvement of human service agency performance. What remains to be studied further is just how great this contribution is, what factors produce it, what can be done to increase it, and how will service system performance be affected as we move from simply the use of paraprofessionals to the implementation of full new careers programs involving new staffing patterns, new organization, and new work to be done by human services agencies.[73]

In addition to the effect upon the quality and character of the health, education and welfare services rendered to individuals by human service agencies, new careers programs have had an effect in several other broad areas. These include Legislation, Manpower Programs, Civil Service, Credentialling, Colleges, Career Advancement, New Service Roles, New Roles for Workers' Groups, studies of costs and benefits, and in connection between new careers programs and community control issues. We can only indicate with brief comments these areas; subsequent articles will address them in greater detail.

Legislation. Since the passage of the new careers amendment (Section 123 (a)(4)) to the Economic Opportunity Act in 1966, every major piece of social welfare legislation enacted by Congress has contained, to at least some extent, aspects of the new careers program. Within the purview of the Department of Health, Education and Welfare, alone, there are some 80 different grant-in-aid programs which contain explicit new careers language and/or provide for the employment, training and upgrading of new

---

[73]The Center for the Study of the Unemployed, School of Social Work, New York University, has received a grant from the Career Opportunity Branch, U.S. Office of Education, to "map" the present and potential research issues raised by the new careers program.

personnel and/or permit by reason of the breadth of the authorizing language implementation of new careers programs. In addition, there are an additional score of programs administered by the Office of Economic Opportunity, the Labor Department, the Justice Department. the Commerce Department, the Agriculture Department, the Department of the Interior, and the Department of Housing and Urban Development. In sum, there are 100 different programs, authorized by 35 different acts of Congress, administered by 8 different departments and agencies.

Manpower Programs. Many of the ideas incorporated in the new careers design have been incorporated in manpower programs both in the public and private sectors.[75] For example, the JOBS program provides for employment first with training built in, and the use of indigenious workers as support personnel. As noted above, the Labor Department now recommends the use of paraprofessionals in such a role noting that their performance here "surpasses that of professional workers."[76] Labor Secretary Shultz, in announcing his Department's priorities, has called not only for jobs but "jobs that are useful to society and that have a potential for personal economic growth."[77] Public service employment programs include new staffing patterns, the establishment of career ladders, the development of career advancement models.

---

[74]See Richard Gould, "Guide to Funding New Careers Programs," Revised Edition, New Careers Development Center, 1969; see also, "A Listing of New Careers Legislation," New Careers Development Center, 1969.

[75]For a brief critique of private sector manpower programs, see Frank Riessman, "A Critique of the JOBS Program," New Careers Development Center, 1968; also Alan Gartner, "Problem Identificatied, Solution Awry: A Proposal to Refocus Manpower Policy," New Careers Development Center, 1969.

[76]"Job Development for the Hard to Employ," loc cit.

[77]Cited in the New Careers Newsletter, Vol. III, No. 1.

Civil Service. In at least 4 states--California, Massachusetts, Minnesota, and New York--civil service or state certification changes have occured.[78] In Massachusetts, for example, a new statewide civil service classification, special service assistant, has been established. This was achieved as a result of the work of Brockton's Self Help, Inc., an OEO and Labor Department funded training program. The new position, at a salary of $408 to $515 a month, does not require a high-school diploma and yet ranks only two steps below the entry B.A. position. Entrance to the new class is based upon training and experience.[79]

California has instituted a state-wide Career Opportunities Program, based on a July 11, 1968 order to all departments and agencies by Governor Reagan. The program, directed by Richard Bernheimer of the State Personnel Board, is geared towards "providing increased career opportunities for the disadvantaged." As outlined in the Governor's memorandum, the purposes of the program include:

1) Identifying the use of the disadvantaged in existing job opportunities of the State Civil Service.

2) Creating new employment and career opportunities by job restructuring.

3) Developing personnel policies which will facilitate placement of the disadvantaged.

4) Upgrading the skills of disadvantaged employees to prepare them for civil service advancement.

Each agency and department has developed a Career Opportunities Team, drawn from top management, and has conducted Phase I of the program which includes a survey of present job opportunities and identification of additional classes appropriate for job restructuring or training programs.[80]

---

[78] New Careers Newsletter, passim

[79] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 6.

[80] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 2.

Phase II, now begun, focuses on the development of special programs for each agency and department. Illustrative of such activities are the programs being developed by the State Department of Public Health. They have developed new job descriptions, career ladders and prepared a budget to implement the program in the Department's laboratories, health education program, and vector control. Among the innovative ideas is a non-written entrance examination for the Health Education Aide position, the waiver of college credit requirements in the vector control program in favor of credit for experience, and the proposal in the laboratory program which gives greater weight to on-the-job experience and training as compared with formal credentials obtained outside of the department.[81]

Credentialling. One of the characteristics of the human services is that workers are credentialled.[82] New careers deals with the issue of credentialling in two ways: first, providing opportunities for new people to traverse accelerated routes to credentials; second, to develop new routes to new jobs and to establish new credentials. There is no overall quantitative data on the number of people in new training and education programs.* It is clear, however, that tens of thousands of people are now involved in training and education programs designed to provide new skills and in many cases leading to certificate and degree programs.

At least two states, Massachusetts and Washington, have undertaken to establish new systems for certifying teachers. The state of California as part of its Career Opportunities Program, now accepts in lieu of education on the job experience, and the recently negotiated contract between the New York City Social Services Department and the Social Services Employees Union (SSEU) provides for advancement from the entry level case aide position to case assistant based on work experience as opposed to

---

[81] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. III, No. 1.

[82] For a persuasive case re. the issue of credentialling, see Sumner M. Rosen, "Credentials: Two Strategies," Social Policy, No. 6., New Careers Development Center (March, 1969).

*Testimony presented by Dr. Jacob Fishman at the House Education and Labor Committee, op cit., indicates that 39% of the trainees in the "Scheuer Amendment program were taking college courses for credit, and an additional 24% were receiving GED instruction.

only formal education.

Colleges. Several hundred colleges have initiated programs for adults engaged in career advancement programs. The two largest college programs are those under the Economic Opportunity Act's new careers program and the Headstart Supplementary Training program. Programs recently established under the Higher Education Act (Titles I, III and IX) and the Education Professions Development Act will provide opportunities for many more people.

Under the new careers programs and the Headstart Supplementary Training program some 200 colleges have undertaken a variety of innovative programs for these new students -- for example, admission of persons with less than normal entrance requirements (e.g. high-school diploma, test scores, etc.); new course offerings and curricula; credit for such activities as work experience. A new program, Veterans in Public Service (VIPS), provides for admission to college of veterans simultaneous with employment in a local school system. The veterans will in four years, while working in and receiving a salary from the school system, obtain a baccalaureat degree and a teaching certificate. These offer precedents and examples but not yet institutionalized change.

The evidence is as yet sparse as to the performance of these new students. One report, from the University of Minnesota, indicates that the new careerists attending the General College have maintained a grade point average somewhat higher than the student body as a whole.

Career Advancement. There are as yet no nurse's aides or hospital orderlies who have become chief of medical services at a hospital nor teacher aides who have become principals. However, mobility has occured; perhaps most often and most extensively in the "new" agencies -- community mental health, narcotics rehabilitation, anti-poverty programs. A recent survey of community action agencies throughout the country found:

--In over 90% of the agencies professional positions were held by persons who had come into the program as poor persons, as nonprofessional workers.

--Nearly one-fifth of the professional positions in community action agencies were occupied by persons who came to work in the program initially as a poor person.

--In some agencies, as high as 35% or more of the professional positions are held by such persons.[83]

Similar statistics are not available on such a broad basis. However, it is reported that in the new careers programs, now operating in more than 100 cities, persons who entered the program in entry positions have now moved a step or two up a ladder.[83a]

In some instances there has been what one might call "career without ladders," that is essentially unstructured career mobility. The most dramatic example is the co-teacher role played by some new careerists in graduate level urban affairs programs at the University of Minnesota. Here persons attending the university's General College are now involved in graduate level teaching.[84] More common, of course, are the instances where "ladders" have been established but which as yet have not been mounted.

In New York City, the first group of nurse's aides have completed an LPN training course, and a new course to move LPNs to RNs has just been established. And in the recently concluded agreement between the Social Services Employers Union and the city's Social Services Department, a full ladder from case aid through case worker is established.[85]

The most dramatic mobility is to be found in the Oakland new careers program operated by the New Careers Development Organization in which all of the staff are new careerists.

---

[83]Based on a survey conducted by the New Careers Training Laboratory, New York University, May, 1969.

[83a]Testimony presented by Dr. Jacob Fishman at the House Education and Labor Committee, op cit., reports that 37% of the trainees are at Level II jobs, and 3% at Level III; the first funded projects were little more than a year old when Dr. Fishman's survey was conducted.

[84]New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 2; also, see Vol. III, No. 2.

[85]See section on New Roles for Workers Groups below.

New Service Roles. While most new careers programs have been involved in training persons for existing positions in human service agencies, some of the reports noted above do indicate new work such as the dental aides, new educational acitivites as co-teachers or the community teachers at Boston's Highland Park Free School, activities in the health area such as the health advocate role established at the Hunts Point, Bronx, Peoples Health Center.[86] This new role is for a person to act on behalf of the patient vis-a-vis the health practicioners and the availability of health facilities. At the Highland Park Free School, two co-equal teachers share classroom responsibilities -- the one a traditionally prepared teacher and the other a community person. Here is a new dimension of team teaching.[87]

Prosposals have been made for new paraprofessional roles; for example, family planning centers to be managed by persons specifically trained for that purpose as opposed to the traditional RN, and day care centers to be directed by persons with specific training in that area. The New Careers Training Laboratory at New York University, is training paraprofessionals to be Career Development Officers, persons who will plan, develop and organize career advancement programs in community action agencies.

The question which must be considered is whether the roles of supervision, evaluation, training, program management are appropriately combined or whether they can be separated. As Dr. Charles Brown, former superintendent of schools in Newton (Mass.) has asked, "Why must a principal have been a teacher?"

Just as there are developing new roles for paraprofessionals, there are evolving new roles for professionals. As noted above, in Hartsdale, New York, teachers have found themselves playing new "diagnostician" roles. The large study conducted under contract with OEO by Bank Street College ofEducation, reports that the introduction of paraprofessionals has effected the role of all the personnel of the school. They note that teachers need and develop skills in analyzing roles in a team situation,

---

[86] New Careers Newsletter, Vol. II, No. 2.

[87] See papers distributed at the National Conference on Paraprofessionals, Career Advancement and Pupil Learning, co-sponsored by TEPS-NEA and the New Careers Development Center, Washington, D.C., January, 1969.

are called on to "orchestrate all resources to meet the needs of individual pupils...in structuring and restructuring a learning environment..."[88]

Professional groups have expressed their concern for how to relate to this new personnel. For example, a research study conducted by the NEA indicated that the number one in-service training need seen by teachers was how to work with the new personnel. And a study conducted by the New York teachers union, the United Federation of Teachers, found that while they experienced difficulties with the School Department's administration, they supported the use, and sought the extension of paraprofessional programs. At a meeting of teachers at one of the schools in the IS 201 Complex in Harlem, the main question raised by the teachers was how to establish and maintain a collegial relationship with the paraprofessionals.

In differing forums and in varying ways many professional groups have expressed their support for new careers programs and/or the employment of paraprofessionals. These include, among others, the American Bar Association, the American Public Health Association, the National Association of Social Workers, the Council on Social Work Education, the National Social Welfare Assembly, the National Education Association, the Joint Commission on Correctional Manpower.

New Roles for Workers Groups. As noted above, various professional groups have taken steps to support new careers programs. Similarly, union groups have supported such programs, and this in the most direct manner of including it in the bargaining negotiations they conduct.

Hospital unions have been among the strongest new careers advocates. District Council 37, American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees (AFSCME) initiated a program to upgrade several hundred nurses aides to licensed practical nurses in New York City. Of the 126 graduates of the first training cycle, over 90% of those who began the 14-month program completed it, and 86% passed the New York State Licensing Examination for

---

[88] Bowman and Klopf, op cit.

Licensed Practical Nurse. A second training cycle has just concluded and a third group is in the midst of the training.[89]

Recently the city has extended the career ladder to upgrade 75 licensed practical nurses to registered nurses over a period of 3 years under a $420,000 grant from the Department of Health, Education and Welfare. Enrollees will work half a day, but they will receive a full day's pay. They will earn 42 nursing and 15 liberal arts credits at classes in the Bellevue-Mills School of Nursing operated by Hunter College, including up to 6 credits for prior training and/or work experience. Credits earned can be applied toward an Associate or Baccalaureate degree at Hunter.

Nationally, AFSCME under a $1,200,000 Labor Department grant, has begun a new program, "Operation Upgrade," in eight hospitals in Boston, Cleveland, and Oakland. Current employees will be trained and upgraded.[90]

Whereas District Council 37 obtained agreement from city hospitals for the aide-LPN ladder but then had to seek special federal funds to finance its initial training and released time program, Local 1199 of the Drug and Hospital Workers Union has taken the first step in making training and upgrading a part of their bargaining package, and thus less dependent on government financing. In the new contract with Local 1199, New York's voluntary hospitals agreed to pay 1% of employees' gross wages into a fund to pay workers while they train for better jobs; this amounts to some $1 million. District Council 37 in its most recent contract has won a per capita allotment for training and upgrading.

Cost-Benefit Analysis. The report noted above of the Minneapolis calculation of a direct public cost benefit of $1.59 for every $1.00 spent in that city's new careers programs program in the public schools is a suggestive piece of evidence and the grant given by the U.S. Office of Education's Research Bureau to make a more elaborate study in Oregon is a step in the right direction. Clearly a great many more such studies of new careers, as well as other social welfare programs, must be undertaken.

---

[89] Public Employee Press, May 2, 1969.

[90] In the current contest between the United Federation of Teachers and the local affiliate of the State, County, and Municipal Employees Union to represent the several thousand paraprofessional employees of New York City's public school system, both groups have sought the support of the paraprofessionals by offering, in addition to traditional union benefits regarding wages and working conditions, promised support for training, career ladders, upgrading, etc. The New York City New Careerist Association has recently voted to support the efforts of Local 372, AFSCME.

Among the special issues of such a cost-benefit analysis of new careers programs is the weighing of the new careers program against other program alternatives; the value of obtaining training and education as compared with the lost work time; the effect upon the productivity of other workers in the system; the comparative value of paraprofessional programs as compared with fully articulated new careers programs; the impact upon the consumer population of differing staffing and organizational patterns; the effect upon the new careerist, his family and community.

Community Participation. New careers programs are of relevance to the community both in terms of their effect upon its members as workers and upon the community as consumers of the employing agencies services. There is a growing acceptance of such programs by human service agencies. The questions one must raise, however, is whether that acceptance marks a commitment to meaningful change or whether the new careerist is individually being coopted and the service he renders is to explain the agency to the community (to shil or huckster for it), to cool out the community.

The sharp attacks under which professional practice finds itself today exacerbates these issues. If new careers is to be but a band-aid on a cancerous situation then the response of the community will be hostile, and properly so. However, if the new careerists become a force for change, acting as the vanguard of the community, powering change, then it becomes a part of the forces questioning present professional practice, challenging professionalism and credentialism, demanding accountability.

Paraprofessionals are being strongly supported by activist community-based programs all over the country, such as Roxbury's (Boston) New School for Children, the NENA Health Project on the Lower East Side, the People's Health Center at Hunt's Point, the Bronx, the Sons and Daughters of Watts, etc. This trend is reflected in the extensive use of aides by the three experimental decentralized school districts in New York City -- IS 201, Ocean Hill-Brownsville, and Two Bridges, as well as the similar programs in Washington, D.C., and elsewhere.

The community groups are probably supporting the expansion of paraprofessionals for a variety of reasons, including the need for jobs; but perhaps even more important is the desire to influence the staffs of the agency or institution, to have

an "inside" (community) voice in the school for example. As one community leader put it: "I'd rather have them working inside than cheering outside."

It can be anticipated that more community attention will now be directed toward how paraprofessionals are selected, trained, utilized and how professionals are trained in working with them (learning from them as well as imparting knowledge to them). Moreover, there will probably be an increasing focus on how paraprofessionals are utilized to improve and change the character of services in the community. Training programs will have to give more consideration to the role of paraprofessionals in system change. The old patronization regarding the use of paraprofessionals is now over. The paraprofessionals will increasingly demand a role, a participant voice in staff decisions inside the agencies, thus reflecting the new demands of community groups outside the agencies. They will be organized and frequently related to militant community based movements and they will probably have a new influence on the unions and union demands.[91]

---

[91]For a fuller discussion of new directions in new careers, and especially the relationship with the community, see "New Ideology of New Careers, New Careers Newsletter, Vol. III, No. 2.